



**Notice of a public meeting of
Economy & Place Policy & Scrutiny Committee**

To: Councillors S Barnes (Chair), Daubeney (Vice-Chair),
Baker, Douglas, Hook, Pearson and K Taylor

Date: Wednesday, 13 November 2019

Time: 5.30 pm

Venue: The Snow Room - Ground Floor, West Offices (G035)

AGENDA

1. Declarations of Interest

At this point, Members are asked to declare:

- any personal interests not included on the Register of Interests
- any prejudicial interests or
- any disclosable pecuniary interests

which they may have in respect of business on this agenda.

2. Minutes (Pages 1 - 8)

To approve and sign the minutes of the Economy & Place Policy & Scrutiny Committee held on 16 October 2019.

3. Public Participation

It is at this point in the meeting that members of the public who have registered to speak can do so. The deadline for registering is **5.00pm on Tuesday 12 November 2019**. Members of the public can speak on agenda items or matters within the remit of the Committee. To register to speak please contact the Democracy Officer for the meeting, on the details at the foot of the agenda.

Filming, Recording or Webcasting Meetings

Please note this meeting may be filmed and webcast, or

recorded, and that includes any registered public speakers, who have given their permission. The broadcast can be viewed at <http://www.york.gov.uk/webcasts> or, if recorded, this will be uploaded onto the Council's website following the meeting. Residents are welcome to photograph, film or record Councillors and Officers at all meetings open to the press and public. This includes the use of social media reporting, i.e. tweeting. Anyone wishing to film, record or take photos at any public meeting should contact the Democracy Officer (contact details are at the foot of this agenda) in advance of the meeting. The Council's protocol on Webcasting, Filming & Recording of Meetings ensures that these practices are carried out in a manner both respectful to the conduct of the meeting and all those present. It can be viewed at http://www.york.gov.uk/download/downloads/id/11406/protocol_f_or_webcasting_filming_and_recording_of_council_meetings_20160809.pdf

- 4. Round table discussions around in-work poverty, gender pay gap and low-pay industries** (Pages 9 - 16)

The purpose of this report is to inform the Committee of the current situation in the city in relation to in-work poverty, the gender pay gap and low-paid industries so Members can take advice from experts at the meeting over which issues they want to take forward in their work plan for the year.
- 5. Update of implementation of recommendations from Economic Health of York City Centre Scrutiny Review** (Pages 17 - 22)

This report provides Members with their first update on the implementation of the approved recommendations arising from the scrutiny review into the Economic Health of York City Centre.
- 6. Work Plan 2019-20** (Pages 23 - 26)

To consider the work plan for the 2019-20 municipal year.
- 7. Urgent Business**

Any other business which the Chair considers urgent under the Local Government Act 1972.

Democracy Officer

Angela Bielby

Email - a.bielby@york.gov.uk

Tel - 01904 552599

For more information about any of the following please contact the Democracy Officer responsible for servicing this meeting:

- Registering to speak
- Business of the meeting
- Any special arrangements
- Copies of reports and
- For receiving reports in other formats

Contact details are set out above.

This information can be provided in your own language.

我們也用您們的語言提供這個信息 (Cantonese)

এই তথ্য আপনার নিজের ভাষায় দেয়া যেতে পারে। (Bengali)

Ta informacja może być dostarczona w twoim własnym języku. (Polish)

Bu bilgiyi kendi dilinizde almanız mümkündür. (Turkish)

یہ معلومات آپ کی اپنی زبان (بولی) میں بھی مہیا کی جاسکتی ہیں۔ (Urdu)

 (01904) 551550

This page is intentionally left blank

City of York Council	Committee Minutes
Meeting	Economy & Place Policy & Scrutiny Committee
Date	16 October 2019
Present	Councillors S Barnes (Chair), Daubeney (Vice-Chair), Baker, Douglas, Hook, Pearson and K Taylor

22. Declarations of Interest

Members were asked to declare, at this point in the meeting, any personal interests not included on the Register of Interests or any prejudicial or discloseable pecuniary interest that they might have in respect of the business on the agenda. There were no further declarations of interest.

23. Minutes

Resolved: That;

- i. The minutes of the Economy and Place Scrutiny Committee meeting held on 12 June 2019 be approved as a correct record and signed by the Chair.
- ii. The minutes of the Economy and Place Scrutiny Committee meeting held on 10 July be amended to include the following changes and be brought back for approval at the next meeting on 13 November 2019:
 - Cllr Baker, not Barker to be listed under Apologies
 - Under Agenda Item 4 [Attendance of the Executive Member for Economy and Strategic Planning] the addition of a point stating that it had been confirmed that there was no 'plan B' should the HIF funding not be received
 - Under Agenda Item 5 [Attendance of the Executive Member for Environment and Climate Change], the Executive Member felt unable to commit at that stage to carbon budgeting from the Council and undertook to give an update at a future meeting in six months.

24. Public Participation

It was reported that there had no registrations to speak under the Council's Public Participation Scheme.

25. Local Industrial Strategy Cover Report

Members considered a report which informed them of the developing Local Industrial Strategies (LIS) covering West Yorkshire, York and North Yorkshire. The reports also outlined where each Local Enterprise Partnership (LEP) was with their LIS and the opportunities for the council to engage with the development process.

The Chair advised that the representative from the West Yorkshire Combined Authority (WYCA) had been invited but was unable to attend the meeting. The Chief Operating Officer for York, North Yorkshire and East Riding (YNYER) LEP, City of York Council (CYC) Corporate Director Economy and Place and CYC Head of Economic Growth were in attendance at the meeting to participate in discussions.

The Chief Operating Officer for YNYER LEP explained the background to LIS in the national context, noting the cross cutting themes regionally which included a focus on the natural assets in terms of two national parks, the heritage assets in York and the North Yorkshire coast.

The Head of Economic Growth noted the different foci of the two LEPs and advised that consultation would inform the draft LIS to be submitted to the government at Christmas. The Corporate Director for Economy and Place reported that officers had made sure that York was represented in both LEPs. He was asked whether there had been an assessment of the risk of being forced to choose one LIS and stated that officers were not in a position to respond but in terms of the approach to central government would be led by Member decision making. As part of this, Members would be fully advised as part of their decision making process.

The Chief Operating Officer for YNYER LEP advised that the future success of the York and North Yorkshire geography was dependent on relationships between Leeds and the Humber. Whatever the outcome of Member decisions, the strength of the relationship with Leeds and Humber was the best it could be in terms of collaboration on a number of projects. He added that businesses would operate where there were opportunities for business and that people would go where the jobs were irrelevant of drawn boundaries.

The Head of Economic Growth was asked if there were any local authorities in a similar position to York and he confirmed that there were other local authorities both LEPS or in two LEPs having to make difficult decisions.

In response to a question concerning the merger talks, the Chief Operating Officer for YNYER LEP stated that the merger talks continued positively and as devolution talks continued, the LEP merger talks would continue at a similar pace. It was important that the LIS recognised the distinctive characteristics of places. Regarding the timeline for the merger, both LEPS were to hold board meetings by end of November. The challenge for both LEPs was the need to make sure their governance arrangements were compliant.

The Head of Economic Growth was asked whether there was scope to widen participation in economic development, for example through the establishment of an economic development partnership board. He explained the structure of the CYC Economic Growth Team and added that at the Executive Member for Economy and Strategic Planning's Decision Session the following day there was a decision to be made concerning engagement with partners across the city regarding inclusive growth.

The Corporate Director for Economy and Place was asked about the breadth of input of York into Leeds LEP compared to YNYER LEP. He explained the scale of the two LEPs in terms of capacity adding that there was a light touch approach to the cultural side of both LEPS. He then explained the differences between the two LEPs noting that both had different styles.

A Member gave feedback on the opportunity for participation with Leeds LEP and the Chief Operating Officer for YNYER LEP offered to feed this back.

In response to a question on the health economy, the Chief Operating Officer for YNYER LEP responded that the sectoral opportunities for the health economy in the industrial strategy was related to the question of scale because in North Yorkshire, York was the big concentration of population whereas in West Yorkshire, York was a city on the edge of large urban conurbations. He added that York had been involved with Leeds LEP on discussions around health technology.

The Chief Operating Officer for YNYER LEP was asked where transport and HS2 fit in to the LIS. He explained that physical and digital connectivity was important to both and that the transfer to a Smart region was particularly important to physical connectivity, and needed to support

environmental and climatic challenges that are around. He added that HS2 was part of discussions on connectivity around the wider region as part of the Northern Powerhouse, Transport for the North and other initiatives. He was then asked for an update on devolution and explained that there had been a change in government focus. He was asked and gave an update on clean growth as an area of commonality in the two draft LIS.

Resolved: That the information on the development of the Local Industrial Strategies for West Yorkshire, York, North Yorkshire and East Riding be noted.

Reason: To inform members about the development of the Local Industrial Strategies.

26. High Value Employment and Skills Update Report

Members considered a report that informed them of the work being done in York to support the growth of the city's economy by promoting High Value Employment and Skills, Apprenticeships and Graduate Retention. The University of York Director of Employability and Skills (also a member of the LEP Skills Board), the Head of Apprenticeships, York St John University, the CYC Assistant Director Education and Skills (also the Chair of Apprenticeship Strategy Council Board) and Vice Principal for Higher, Vocational and Professional Education at York College were all in attendance to take part in discussions. The Head of Economic Growth and Economic Growth Assistant were in attendance to present the report. The Economic Growth Assistant gave a presentation on High Value Employment and Skills.

It was noted that some employers found it difficult to utilise their apprentice levy and the Chair asked what the extent of this challenge was in York, what percentage of the levy was not spent on education and skills training in York and how the levy could be used to address middle skills. The Head of Apprenticeships, York St John University (YSJU) explained that at YSJU, small and medium sized enterprises (SMEs) had found it difficult to access higher and degree level apprenticeships because the Education and Skills Finding Agency gave non levy contracts to certain training providers which made it difficult for the SME community to engage with higher degree level apprenticeships. This would be changing over the next 12 months where any size employer would be able to access any training provider and any apprenticeship training provision they wish to. There would be a piece of work on this over the next 12 months from an education perspective to support SMEs to help SMEs engage, retain and recruit high level and high skill talent into their business.

The Head of Apprenticeships, York St John University was asked if the system was changing significantly so that if the barriers to access were taken away, whether businesses had opted out. She explained that there were pilot projects going through the system at the moment to test this with SMEs. It was not known whether these were real or perceived barriers for SMEs. The CYC Assistant Director Education and Skills explained that the council had been working through its business engagement officer to look at some of the barriers that SMEs faced in terms of taking on apprentices. She noted that apprentice take up internally at CYC was high. She explained the bureaucratic issues faced by SMEs with the apprenticeship levy transfer.

The Vice Principal for Higher, Vocational and Professional Education at York College reported that from Sept 2020 any employer that has an apprentice on the new standards rather than the previous frameworks was going to be responsible for organising and funding Assessors for the end point assessment, which may create a further barrier for SMEs. The CYC Assistant Director Education and Skills added that it was important to understand the pattern of apprenticeships across the city as the majority were at level 2 and not at the highest value as apprenticeship.

Members asked whether there had been any research into local apprenticeship demands. The CYC Assistant Director Education and Skills advised that there was a business engagement officer within the council skills team who is surveying opportunities. She advised that there was a need to understand nature of SMEs in York and whether there were appropriate apprenticeships for them to access. The University of York Director of Employability and Skills added that the larger employers were not utilising all of their levy so there was levy left over. He added that there was not enough agility at university level as universities designed their programmes in very different ways to what employers wanted and expected. There were also new roles around the assessment of learning that have recently come into effect and large companies could not access apprenticeships because they already had the skills in their workforce which was causing issues and challenges in larger employers utilising their levy.

With regard to middle skills the Head of Economic Growth explained that Standard Occupational Classes (SOC) codes were used to categorise jobs. The Vice Principal for Higher, Vocational and Professional Education at York College advised that this year York College had seen a shift in higher level apprenticeships which showed a small lift in the number of employers using their levy especially in engineering. She added that York College construction apprenticeships for 16-18 year olds had increased, especially

the numbers progressing from Level 2 to Level 3. The CYC Assistant Director Education and Skills advised that the CYC apprenticeship hub had been seeing a fall in the numbers of younger apprenticeships 16-19 and seeing an increase in over 24s. The Head of Apprenticeships, York St John University added that YSJU the biggest programme by far was data science degree apprenticeship.

The Chair asked non CYC attendees whether the Committee should take the apprenticeship topic forward. This was supported by those present. It was noted that Higher York had recently been refreshed and that the DfE was currently consulting on higher technical skills qualifications that will be introduced in 2022. The Corporate Director for Economy and Place drew attention to the CYC £300million capital programme moving forward and the house building that would progress following approval of the Local Plan meant the city would be in need of higher skilled people moving back into their industry.

Members asked if the construction needs of the Local Plan and the retrofitting of council homes to the passive house standard would see the need to upskill workers in low carbon building. The Vice Principal for Higher, Vocational and Professional Education at York College explained that sustainable construction is a gap at the college and they are looking into developing this.

Members asked what the city could do to improve graduate retention rates. The University of York Director of Employability and Skills explained that of the two universities in York in 2017, 32.4% of graduates that stayed in the region, 35.4% stayed in surrounding institutions and 32.2% went to areas in London and the south east. Of the graduates that originally came from York and the north Yorkshire region, 40.3% of them stayed, 32% stayed in the surrounding regions and 27.7% went to areas in London and the south east. From a York perspective the universities retained 24.4% of their students, 20% of which stayed for further study not employment.

The Head of Economic Growth highlighted that a graduate destinations study was available and he highlighted the need for there to be more graduate jobs in the city to enable graduates to stay in the city. The CYC Assistant Director Education and Skills added that this was also linked to the curriculum at the two universities and how far they were enabling graduates to access what was available within the local area because if there is a mismatch between those, students would go elsewhere to study.

The Head of Apprenticeships, York St John University advised the need to be mindful that as an institution and as an education provider, YSJU was

there to meet the needs of students, not to fill a skills gap. She noted that transferable skills were available from a range of different degrees.

Members asked if there was a problem with underemployment in York. The Head of Economic Growth advised that half of the jobs in York were in retail and social care so in effect there were many people in York underemployed. The University of York Director of Employability and Skills added that graduates that stay in York are no more or less underemployed than graduates in other cities. The challenge for graduates staying in the region was that there was not that many large employers that offer the development that graduates expected and wanted and SMEs did not have the time or resource to develop graduates. The Vice Principal for Higher, Vocational and Professional Education at York College highlighted there is an Institute of Technology for Yorkshire and Humberside in York to develop progression routes from Level 3 upwards in construction, surveying and moving onto sustainable construction.

Discussion took place about innovation and the relationships with industry. The University of York Director of Employability and Skills explained that the university had an ERDF funded product and process innovation projects (PAPI) about enhancing productivity through innovation. This involved grants for SMEs to buy equipment and the sectors that that funding had gone into included advanced manufacturing, food and drink, and creativity. He noted that the funding came to an end in 2023. The Head of Apprenticeships, York St John University explained that through development of relationships with employers, YSJU were finding that this had an impact on curriculum in terms of future skills needs. They also had a successful programme at the university to support recent graduates and alumni to set up their own businesses.

Concerning a question about Intellectual Property (IP), the University of York Director of Employability and Skills explained that for student start-ups and enterprises the student would own 100% of the IP. The problem for graduate new business start-ups was the lack of infrastructure in York. He stated that the university would be happy to engage with CYC and other education-provider partners to look at opportunities for this, with York Central serving as a good opportunity for this.

Members asked whether there was innovation amongst staff members and where IP sat within those partnerships. The Head of Economic Growth explained that there was a challenge for providing work space for start-ups and spin outs when they become too big and there was a need to provide space for those businesses to scale up and grow.

All were thanked for attending at it was:

Resolved: Having considered the information provided in this report and at the meeting Members are asked to agree which issues they want to take forward to their work plan either through further update reports or by a scrutiny review into a specific topic.

Reason: So the committee has a balanced and effective work plan.

27. Work Plan

Members considered the Work Plan and after discussion agreed that it be updated to include the following items for consideration at future meetings:

Wednesday 13 November 2019

1. Round table discussions around in-work poverty, gender pay gap and low-pay industries.
2. Update of implementation of recommendations from Economic Health of York City Centre Scrutiny Review
3. Work Plan 2019-20

Tuesday 10 December 2019

1. Overview report from Highways Team
2. 2nd Quarter Finance and Performance Monitoring Report.
3. Apprenticeship and Skills Scoping Report
4. Update of implementation of recommendations from York Residents' Priority parking Scheme Scrutiny Review (slipped from November).
5. Work Plan 2019-20

Resolved: That the above items for the Committee's work plan for the 2019/20 municipal year be considered at the next meeting.

Reason: To keep the Committee's work plan updated.

Cllr S Barnes, Chair

[The meeting started at 5.30 pm and finished at 8.05 pm].



**Economy and Place Policy and Scrutiny
Committee****13 November 2019**

Report of the Assistant Director – Legal & Governance

In-work Poverty; Gender Pay Gap and Low-paid Industries**Summary**

1. The purpose of this report is to inform the Committee of the current situation in the city in relation to in-work poverty, the gender pay gap and low-paid industries so Members can take advice from experts at the meeting over which issues they want to take forward in their work plan for the year.

Background

2. At the September 2019 meeting of this Committee, Members further discussed their work programme for the municipal year and decided to split work plan suggestions into three categories:
 - i. Pay in work poverty; Gender pay gap; Low paid industries
 - ii. High Value Jobs and Innovation; Apprenticeships and Skills; Graduate Retention; Stem the loss of skilled people
 - iii. Sustainable Growth and Social Values; Community Wealth
3. Members agreed they wanted to consider the second category at the Committee's October meeting and to invite representatives from City of York Council (CYC), the University of York, York College and York St John University to attend to take part in round-table discussions.
4. At the October meeting Members agreed that they next wanted to examine issues around in-work poverty, the gender pay gap and low paid industries and to invite people with the relevant knowledge in these areas to the November meeting to advise Members.

In work poverty

5. In the UK there are now almost four million workers in poverty, a rise of over half a million compared with five years ago and the highest number on record. The employment rate is also at a record high, but this has not delivered lower poverty. Since 2004/05, the number of workers in poverty has increased at a faster rate than the total number of people in employment, resulting in workers being increasingly likely to find themselves in poverty.
6. Latterly the rise in in-work poverty has been driven almost entirely by the increase in the poverty rate of working parents, which has grown over the past five years. A working parent is now over one-and-a-half times more likely to be in poverty than a working non-parent as most single people and childless couples, however low their wages, earn enough to live above the poverty threshold.
7. In many cases the cause of in-work poverty are long-term changes in the labour market with more self-employment, part-time employment, zero-hours contracts and sporadic employment. The repeated mantra that work is the best way out of poverty is no longer true. Non-take up of benefits remains a problem and often poorer families have to use their food budget to pay other fixed costs.

Low wages

8. The minimum wage is not high enough to lift a full-time employed family with one earner above the poverty threshold. In 2013 three large employers in York became Voluntary Living Wage (VLW) employers – CYC; Joseph Rowntree Foundation / Joseph Rowntree Housing Trust and York St John University. Other York employers subsequently also became VLW employers including Nestle and Aviva. So while a number of key employers are paying the living wage, not all are.

Short hours

9. Many employees are not working full time and are often constrained by caring responsibilities. Childcare is expensive.

In-work benefit cuts

10. The growth in in-work poverty in the UK has mainly occurred since 2011 when austerity began. The cut in working age benefits have taken

£30 billion from the social security budget.

Gender pay gap

11. The gender pay gap is the difference in the average hourly wage of all men and women across a workforce. If women do more of the less well paid jobs within an organisation than men, the gender pay gap is usually bigger.
12. In York the gap in the average gross weekly between men and women has risen from £33.6 in 2010 to £76.6 in 2018, but it is still less than both the national and regional difference.

Gender Pay Gap	York	National	Regional
Year	Difference	Difference	Difference
	(£)	(£)	(£)
2010	33.6	101.3	94.5
2011	53.9	100.6	97.5
2012	78.8	99	94
2013	98.5	99.3	105.9
2014	98.9	99.6	101.3
2015	81.3	99.7	99.3
2016	117	99.8	106.5
2017	115.7	100.3	105
2018	76.6	102.2	101.4

York Annual Pay 2015-2019

13. According to figures published on 29 October 2019 in the government Annual Survey of Hours and Earnings, the average weekly earnings for York workers increased by 13% over the last year. The survey also showed that the average weekly earnings for York residents also rose from £512.60 in 2018 to £574.60; an increase of 12%.
14. The wage increase in York compares favourably to other areas across the UK, with pay across the country increasing by 2.8%; a 1.9% increase

for Leeds residents and an increase of 3.5% across the Leeds City Region.

People who work in York

	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019
Full time median	£25,622	£26,113	£26,448	£26,506	£29,631
Full time mean	£30,080	£30,588	£32,020	£30,790	£34,680
Part time median	£9,653	£9,632	£10,440	£9,536	£10,988
Part time mean	£11,352	£12,544	£12,926	£10,822	£14,486
Total median	£17,637	£17,872	£18,444	£18,021	£20,309
Total mean	£20,716	£21,566	£22,473	£20,806	£24,583

Residents of York

	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019
Full time median	£25,622	£26,096	£25,956	£26,688	£28,671
Full time mean	£30,472	£31,687	£32,104	£32,643	£39,077
Part time median	£9,421	£9,783	£9,929	£10,283	£10,729
Part time mean	£11,640	£11,894	£12,127	£12,218	£12,984
Total median	£17,521	£17,939	£17,942	£18,485	£19,700
Total mean	£21,056	£21,790	£22,115	£22,430	£26,030

15. These figures contrast to the 2018 Annual Survey of Hours and Earning when the average full-time gross weekly pay in the city was £591.10, down 6.31% from the 2017 average of £630.90.

Average gross weekly pay by workplace 2017-18**Full time**

	2017	2018		
York	£630.90	£591.10	↓	6.31%
National	£663.50	£687.90	↑	3.68%
Regional	£584.80	£614.10	↑	5.01%

Part time

	2017	2018		
York	£225.40	£203.00	↓	9.94%
National	£263.00	£203.00	↑	3.45%
Regional	£212.10	£216.70	↑	2.65%

Full Time Gross Weekly pay showing historic data from 2010 to 2018

	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018
York	£563.6	£563.5	£576.2	£580.9	£566	£582.4	£581.2	£630.9	£591.1
Region	£535.7	£537.2	£542.6	£553.3	£554.9	£567.1	£576.6	£584.8	£614.1
National	£601.3	£605.1	£610.1	£622.4	£623.2	£629.2	£647.2	£663.5	£687.9

Analysis

16. This report is for information only.

Consultation

17. There has been no consultation in the preparation of this report. To help the Committee's considerations representatives from the University of York, Joseph Rowntree Foundation, Yorkshire the Humber TUC and a major York retailer have been invited to this meeting to inform and advise Members.

Options

18. Having considered the information provided in this report and at the meeting, Members can agree which issues they wish to take forward on the Committee work plan or agree to undertake a more detailed review of one or more of the topics highlighted.

Council Plan

19. This report is linked to several priorities in the Council Plan 2019-2023 including Well-paid Jobs and an Inclusive Economy; Good Health and Wellbeing; A Better Start for Children and Young People and An Open and Effective Council.

Implications

20. There are no Financial, Human Resources (HR), Equalities, Legal, Crime and Disorder, Information Technology (IT), Property or other implications associated with the recommendation in this report.

Risk Management

21. There are no risks associated with the recommendation in this report.

Recommendations

22. Having considered the information provided in this report and at the meeting Members are asked to agree which issues they want to take forward to their work plan either through further update reports or by a scrutiny review into a specific topic

Reason: So the Committee has a balanced and effective work plan

Contact Details

Author:

Steve Entwistle

Scrutiny Officer

Tel: 01904 554279

steven.entwistle@york.gov.uk

Chief Officer Responsible for the report:

Dawn Steel,

Head of Civic and Democratic Services.

Tel: 01904 551030

dawn.steel@york.gov.uk

Report Approved **Date** 31/10/2019

Wards Affected:

All

For further information please contact the author of the report

This page is intentionally left blank



Economy and Place Policy and Scrutiny Committee

13 November 2019

Report of the Assistant Director – Legal & Governance

Implementation of Recommendations from Economic Health of York City Centre Scrutiny Review – Cover Report**Summary**

1. This report provides Members with their first update on the implementation of the approved recommendations arising from the scrutiny review into the Economic Health of York City Centre.

Background

2. In June 2018 the former Economy and Place Scrutiny Committee welcomed the former Executive Member for Economic Development and Community Engagement to its meeting and also received a presentation from CYC Head of Economic Growth which updated Members on the Economic Strategy. During the meeting Members expressed concerns at the number of empty shops in the city centre, particularly a cluster of empty shops on Coney Street, but accepted that addressing this problem was complicated.
3. It was subsequently agreed it would be useful to undertake a full Committee review of the city centre economy, the immediate problems faced and what measures could be taken to resolve them. In July 2018 the Committee considered a scoping report on the city centre economy and agreed it was a topic worthy of further investigation. Members agreed to undertake a full committee scrutiny review with the remit:

Remit

Aim:

To understand the economic health of York city centre and where the Council can influence the city centre economy.

Objectives:

- i. To examine all the available evidence about York city centre as a retail location and how this has changed in recent years;
 - ii. Consider the factors that influence the city centre economy and what role the Council has to play;
 - iii. Understand the global trends that underpin changes in retail and the city centre environments and how these might affect York;
 - iv. Identify the Council's priorities with regard to the city centre economy.
4. Over a series of meetings the former E&P Scrutiny Committee was guided by CYC's Head of Economic Growth and consulted with representatives from Make It York, York Business Improvement District, Indie York, York Retail Forum and York Food Festival.
 5. The information gathered led to the Committee agreeing the recommendations detailed in Annex 1. These were endorsed by the former Economy and Place Policy Development Committee at its meeting on 29 January 2019 and, with a minor amendment, by the former Executive Member for Economic Development and Community Engagement at a Decision Session in March 2019.

Consultation

6. There was no consultation involved in the production of this report. The consultations involved in the Economic Health of York City Centre Scrutiny Review are detailed in the final report listed in background papers.

Options

7. Members may choose to sign off any individual recommendation where implementation has now been completed and can:
 - a. Request further updates and the attendance of the relevant officer at a further meeting to clarify any outstanding recommendations
 - b. Agree no further updates are required.

Analysis

8. There is no analysis in this report.

Council Plan

9. This report is linked to several priorities in the Council Plan 2019-2023 including: Well-Paid Jobs and an Inclusive Economy; A Greener and Cleaner City; Getting Around Sustainability; An Open and Effective Council and Safe Communities and Culture for All.

Implications

10. There are no known Financial, Human Resources, Equalities, Legal, ICT or other implications associated with the recommendation in this report. Implications arising from the scrutiny review are detailed in the Final Report.

Risk Management

11. In compliance with the Council's risk management strategy, there are no known risks associated with this report. Risks associated with the review recommendations are included in the Final Report.

Conclusions

12. There are no conclusions in this report.

Recommendations

13. Members are asked to note the content of this report and:

- 1) Sign off the review recommendations that have been fully implemented
- 2) Agree whether a further update is required in 6 months' time

Reason: To raise awareness of those recommendations which are still to be fully implemented.

Contact Details

Author:

Steve Entwistle
Scrutiny Officer
Tel: 01904 554279

steven.entwistle@york.gov.uk

Chief Officer Responsible for the report:

Dawn Steel,
Head of Civic and Democratic Services.
Tel: 01904 551030

dawn.steel@york.gov.uk

Report Approved **Date** 4/11/2019

Wards Affected:

All

For further information please contact the author of the report

Background Papers:

Economic Health of York City Centre Scrutiny Review Final Report

<http://modgov.york.gov.uk/ecSDDisplay.aspx?NAME=SD2435&ID=2435&RPID=22433973>

Annexes

Annex 1 – Update of implementation of review recommendations.

Update of Implementation of Recommendations from Economic Health of York City Centre Scrutiny as amended by the former Executive Member for Economic Development and Community Engagement on 22 March 2019

Recommendation	Implementation November 2019
That Council:	
i. Agrees a grant of £10,000 to the business sector, delegated to the Head of Economic Growth to decide and administer the grant;	Grant of £10,000 awarded to Indie York to support its operations in 2019/20.
ii. Considers making a bid to the £675 million Future High Streets Fund to secure funding to help York respond and adapt to changes facing city centres;	Bid was submitted but was unsuccessful. A subsequent (and also unsuccessful) bid was submitted for the Heritage High Streets fund. No reasons given by Government for why York's bids were unsuccessful, but main focus has been on areas with significant failure in local economy.
iii. Prepares a long-term strategy to make its high streets and the city centre fit for the future, taking into account relevant aspects of the Grimsey report and the view of all key stakeholders;	MyCityCentre project agreed in budget, and work now beginning on developing engagement towards a long term strategy for the city centre.
iv. Develops an easy but comprehensive and consistent guide to help businesses access relevant information around Council policies	Currently with the designers, this will be launched during York Business Week.

<p>effecting businesses, such as planning and licensing issues and alike;</p>	
<p>v. Examines ways of extending the city’s traditional festivals venue in Parliament Street to open up other areas to visitors, particularly across the river into Micklegate, and reduce pedestrian congestion in parts of the city at peak hours;</p>	<p>Part of MyCityCentre project, and also being explored with Make It York as part of their next Business Plan and SLA.</p>
<p>vi. Works with Indie York and traders to develop a city-wide loyalty scheme to make it easier for businesses to reward customers with an attractive discount offer for shopping locally while encouraging business growth and customer retention across a city-wide customer engagement platform;</p>	<p>York Gift Card launched by York BID in October 2019. Review of York Card currently being undertaken by Explore – opportunities to link with Minster Badge and other Incentive Cards is included in this work.</p>
<p>vii. Incentivises ways to further encourage more people to use Park and Ride and work with bus operators to extend the operating hours of Park and Ride to help reduce vehicle congestion in the city;</p>	<p>Park & Ride evening hours extended beyond Xmas 2018 pilot and are now part of core hours.</p>
<p>viii. Notes the suggestion of an option to seek to make provision in the 2020/21 revenue budget for a grant fund to support independent traders groups, such as Indie York and others.</p>	<p>Independent Traders grant fund included as part of the Inclusive Growth Fund announced by the Leader at his decision session in September 2019 and funded through July 2019 supplementary budget.</p>

Economy and Place Policy and Scrutiny Committee

Draft Work Plan 2019-20

<p>Wednesday 12 June @ 5.30pm</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Arrangements for Scrutiny in York 2. Draft Work Plan and work planning for the new municipal year.
<p>Wednesday 10 July @ 5.30pm</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Attendance of the Executive Member for Economy and Strategic Planning – Priorities and Challenges for 2019-20 2. Attendance of the Executive Member for Transport 3. Bi-Annual Update Report from the Managing Director of Make It York 4. Annual Report of the Executive Director of York BID 5. Year End Finance and Performance Monitoring Report 6. Work Plan 2019-20 and work planning for the year
<p>Wednesday 11 September @ 5.30pm</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Attendance of the Executive Member for Economy and Strategic Planning – Priorities and Challenges for 2019-20 2. Attendance of the Executive Member for Environment and Climate Change 3. CYC Flood defences Action Plan – Biannual Report 4. Work Plan 2019-20 and work planning for the year
<p>Wednesday 16 October @ 5.30pm</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Attendance of representatives from Leeds City Region (LCR) and York, North Yorkshire and East Riding (YNYER) Local Enterprise Partnerships for discussions around Local Industrial Strategy. 2. Round table discussions around High Value Employment and Skills, Graduate Retention and the loss of skilled people.

	3. Work Plan 2019-20
Wednesday 13 November @ 5.30pm	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Round table discussions around in-work poverty, gender pay gap and low-pay industries. 2. Update of implementation of recommendations from Economic Health of York City Centre Scrutiny Review 3. Work Plan 2019-20
Tuesday 10 December @ 5.30pm	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Overview report from Highways Team 2. 2nd Quarter Finance and Performance Monitoring Report. 3. Apprenticeship and Skills Scoping Report 4. Update of implementation of recommendations from York Residents' Priority parking Scheme Scrutiny Review (slipped from November). 5. Work Plan 2019-20
Wednesday 15 January @ 5.30pm	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Work Plan 2019-20
Wednesday 12 February @ 5.30pm	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Work Plan 2019-20 2. Bi-Annual Update Report from the Managing Director of Make It York
Wednesday 11 March @ 5.30pm	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. CYC Flood Defences Action Plan – Biannual Report 2. Work Plan 2019-20
Wednesday 15 April	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Work Plan 2019-20

@ 5.30pm	
Wednesday 20 May @ 5.30pm	1. Work Plan 2019-20

Future Areas of Policy Development

- Economic Strategy 2020–2025 - Building in Economic Metrics & Performance Assessment
- Community Infrastructure Levy
- Supplementary Planning Guidance – Priorities for York

This page is intentionally left blank